Windkraft und Gesundheit

Dr. Günther Frank

Facharzt für Anästhesiologie und
Intensivmedizin

2521, Trumau

Kürzeste Distanz zu gewidmetem Wohngebiet:
1200m

1000m

Blick von der Steinackerstraße Richtung Hofer

Größe realistisch!

Meine Interessenskonflikte:

Der zukünftige Blick von meinem Grundstück.
Die Sorge um die Gesundheit meiner Familie.
Die Sorge um den Wertverlust meines Hauses.

- My Library
- All References (49)
- Unfiled (0)
- Trash (4)
- My Groups
 - wind turbine health (49)
- Find Full Text

Author	Year	Journal	Title	Rating
Alimohammadi, I.; Sa...	2013	Environ Monit Assess	The effects of low frequency noise on mental perform...	
Alves-Pereira, M.; Br...	2014	Aust N Z J Public He...	Letter to the Editor re: 'How the factoid of...	
Arnett, E. B.; Hein, C. ...	2013	PLoS One	Evaluating the Effectiveness...	
Bakker, R. H.; Peders...	2012	Sci Total Environ	Impact of wind...	
Berglund, B.; Hassme...	1996	J Acoust Soc Am		
Bohrer, G.; Zhu, K.; J...	2013	PLoS One		
Caduff, M.; Huijbregt...	2012			
Chapman, S.; St G...				
Ch...				
			...ers and spatial f...	
			...posure-response relationship...	
			...adverse health effects of industrial wind turbines	★★★★
			...adverse health effects of industrial wind turbines	★★★★
			...Industrial wind turbines and adverse health effects	★★★★
			...Health effects and wind turbines: a review of the literature	★★★★
...get, F....	2013	PLoS One	Estimating bat and bird mortality occurring at wind ene...	★★★★
...arpas, D.; Mroczek, ...	2013	Ann Agric Environ M...	Health impact of wind farms	★★★★
Larsson, C.; Ohlund, O.	2014	J Acoust Soc Am	Amplitude modulation of sound from wind turbines un...	
Lee, S.; Lee, S.; Lee, S.	2013	J Acoust Soc Am	Numerical modeling of wind turbine aerodynamic noise...	
Leventhall, G.	2007	Prog Biophys Mol Biol	What is infrasound?	
Long, C. V.; Flint, J. A.;...	2010	J Acoust Soc Am	Wind turbines and bat mortality: Doppler shift profiles ...	

Preview S0022215112002964a.pdf

The Journal of Laryngology & Voice, 137, 225-228
doi:10.1097/00005511-201202000000000

'Wind turbine syndrome': fact or fiction?

A FARHOOEI¹, R. CHUNKHORN², A. TRINDADE³

¹Department of ENT Head and Neck Surgery, ²Glaxo-Well Hospital, Head Office, and ³Department of Neurology, Great Ormond Street Hospital, Birmingham, England, UK, and ⁴Department of ENT Head and Neck Surgery, James Paget Hospital, Great Grimsby, England

Abstract
Objective: Symptoms, including tinnitus, ear pain and vertigo, have been reported following exposure to wind turbine noise. This review addresses the effects of industrial and low frequency noise and questions the validity of 'wind turbine syndrome'.
Design: This review is based on a search for articles published within the last 10 years, conducted using the PubMed database and Google Scholar search engines, which included in their title or abstract the terms 'wind turbine', 'infrasound' or 'low frequency noise'.
Results: There is evidence that infrasound has a physiological effect on the ear. Wind turbine noise is only heard, it is impossible to conclude that wind turbine noise does not cause any of the symptoms described. There is no evidence that these symptoms are related to the noise caused by commercial motor engines. There is some evidence of symptoms in patients exposed to wind turbine noise. The effects of infrasound require further investigation.

Keywords: Wind; Auditory Perception; Auditory Threshold

Introduction
Recently there concerns, reported in the UK, relating to wind turbine noise, health, environmental impacts, including the generation and sleep deprivation (Table 1) (1). The term 'wind turbine syndrome' was first coined by Paganini, who first raised the issue of 'wind turbine syndrome'. It is proposed that the symptoms described are caused by exposure to industrial and low frequency noise produced by the wind turbines.
There are currently 4015 wind turbines in the UK, and the figure is set to triple. Since there will be a corresponding increase in the population exposed to this low frequency noise, concerns about the health effects of wind turbines are likely to grow. This review aims to increase the general awareness of the general practitioner and local ENT service.
This review addresses the biological effects of infrasound and low frequency noise, and reviews the available literature supporting the validity of wind turbine syndrome.
Definitions
Infrasound is defined as sound with a frequency of less than 20 Hz, and low frequency noise as sound with a frequency of less than 200 Hz. (2) Low frequency noise is generated by many everyday sources such as household appliances, transportation and industrial machinery. (3) There are natural sources of infrasound such as ocean waves and volcanoes, as well as natural sources such as the heartbeat and respiration. A child playing an air organ experiences levels of infrasound of approximately 119 dB. (4) Some large concerts may use infrasound for communication.
Infrasound is commonly misperceived as sound that is heard. There is no definite distinction between what is audible and what is not. Studies have shown a hearing threshold as low as 4 Hz can be estimated in an acoustic chamber, and 1.5 Hz for telephone hearing. (5) Infrasound, if presented at a high enough level, may indeed be audible. (6) To

Accepted for publication 1 November 2012. First published online 21 January 2013

225

...turbine syndrome. (7) Otological symptoms such as vertigo, tinnitus and ear pain have been reported, and have been proposed to be caused by prolonged exposure of the vestibulocochlear system to infrasound and low frequency noise. (8) Other reported symptoms include sleep disturbance, headaches and concentration problems. This collection of symptoms has been colloquially termed wind turbine syndrome, but this is not currently a clinically recognised diagnosis. (9)

Measuring noise

**Basis = Fachliteratur:
49 Fachartikel aus medizinisch
wissenschaftlicher Datenbank**

Mögliche Ursachen für Gesundheitsschäden

- Lärm
- Infraschall
- Ärger und Frust
- Stress
- Schlafstörungen

Windpark Tattendorf, Foto Frank

Lärm

- **Zwei Arten von Lärm:** aerodynamisch und mechanisch.
- Fremder Lärm, als raschelnd oder pochend beschrieben.
- **Sehr unangenehm** und schwer durch Umgebungslärm unterdrückt.
- **Während der Nacht mehrere km hörbar.**

A wind turbine generates **two types of noise:** aerodynamic (from rotor) and mechanical (from rotating mechanisms). Aerodynamic noise has been compared to the rustle of tree branches during a breeze. Mechanical noise may be minimized by the application of proven engineering practices and planning tools to estimate wind farm noise [31]. Both the speed of wind and its direction frequently change, which cause the airstream to be seldom stable. Additionally, wind velocity increases with height, especially at night, which may lead to **turbulence from nearby machinery (e.g. turbines) producing a strange noise, sometimes referred to as 'swishing' or 'thumping'**. These sounds are described as **very irritating and hardly disguised by ambient noise** [34, 35, 36]. The spread of noise produced by wind farms depends not only on constructional solutions, the sizes and number of turbines, but also wind direction and its character (calm or turbulent). While on a summer day, even while strong wind blows, this noise is audible at a distance of no more than several hundred meters, and **at night it can be heard even at a distance of several kilometres** [37].

Kurpas D, Mroczek B, Karakiewicz B, Kassolik K, Andrzejewski W: **Health impact of wind farms**. *Annals of agricultural and environmental medicine* : AAEM 2013, **20**(3):595-604.

Shafii S et al:
Visualization and analysis of vortex-turbine intersections in wind farms. *IEEE transactions on visualization and computer graphics* 2013, **19**(9):1579-1591.

Kaplan.²⁴ The fact that a non-urbanised setting has been linked to restorative properties such as “not being distracted”²⁵ suggests that audio and visual distractions caused by wind turbines could change a rural environment from restorative to non-restorative.

Of the coping strategies identified, discussing and seeking information appeared to be most successful as this was correlated with less strain. This finding should be acknowledged in the planning of wind turbines, by giving people living in intended wind farm areas relevant information and possibilities to communicate with the developers and authorities.

... hörbare und sichtbare Ablenkung verursacht durch Windkraftwerke kann eine ländliche Gegend **von erholsam zu nicht erholsam** verändern

Zur Verarbeitung sind **Informationen und Diskussionen** hilfreich zur Stressreduktion. Daher sollten bei der Planung **Informationen und Möglichkeit zur Kommunikation** von den Politikern zur Verfügung gestellt werden.

Pedersen E, Persson Wayne K: **Wind turbine noise, annoyance and self-reported health and well-being in different living environments.** *Occupational and environmental medicine* 2007, **64**(7):480-486.

Mögliche Auswirkungen auf die Gesundheit

TABLE I

CORE SYMPTOMS OF 'WIND TURBINE SYNDROME'^{2,3}

Sleep disturbance
Headache
Visceral, vibratory &/or vestibular dysfunction
Dizziness, vertigo, unsteadiness
Tinnitus
Ear pressure or pain
External auditory canal sensation
Memory & concentration deficits
Irritability, anger
Fatigue, loss of motivation

- Schlafstörungen
- Kopfschmerzen
- Gleichgewichts Störungen
- Schwindel
- Tinnitus (Ohrgeräusch)
- Druck oder Schmerz im Ohr
- Merk- und Konzentrations- Schwäche
- Erregbarkeit und Ärger
- Müdigkeit und Motivationsverlust

Farboud A, Crunkhorn R, Trinidad A: '**Wind turbine syndrome**': fact or fiction? *The Journal of laryngology and otology* 2013, **127**(3):222-226.

cies.^{3,12} Vibroacoustic disease, like wind turbine syndrome, remains unproven and has not found general acceptance within the scientific community.¹²

Conclusion

There is ample evidence of symptoms arising in individuals exposed to wind turbine noise. Some researchers maintain that the effects of wind turbine syndrome are clearly just examples of the well known stress effects of exposure to noise, as displayed by a small proportion of the population.²¹ However, there is an increasing body of evidence suggesting that infrasound and low frequency noise have physiological effects on the ear.⁸ Until these effects are fully understood, it is impossible to state conclusively that exposure to wind turbine noise does not cause any of the symptoms described. The effects of infrasound and low frequency noise require further investigation.

Farboud A, Crunkhorn R, Trinidad A: 'Wind turbine syndrome': fact or fiction?
The Journal of laryngology and otology 2013, **127**(3):222-226.

Das Wind Turbinen Syndrom bleibt unbewiesen und ist in der wissenschaftlichen Gesellschaft nicht anerkannt.

- Deutliche Hinweise, dass bei Geräuschbelastigung Symptome auftreten.
- Es gibt zunehmende Hinweise, dass **Infraschall Wirkungen am Ohr hat.**
- Unmöglich zu beweisen, dass Windkraft-Lärm keine Schäden verursacht.
- **Weitere Forschung ist erforderlich!**

Results: Conclusions of the peer reviewed literature differ in some ways from those in the popular literature. In peer reviewed studies, wind turbine annoyance has been statistically associated with wind turbine noise, but found to be more strongly related to visual impact, attitude to wind turbines and sensitivity to noise. To date, no peer reviewed articles demonstrate a direct causal link between people living in proximity to modern wind turbines, the noise they emit

- Beeinträchtigung durch Windkraft wird **verstärkt durch**
 - Sichtbarkeit,
 - negative Einstellung und
 - Lärmempfindlichkeit
- Gesundheitsschäden sind **abhängig von der Entfernung.**
- **Windkraft kann die Gesundheit negativ beeinflussen, z.B.:**
Schlafstörungen bei Geräuschpegel > 40 dB.
- Meist sind es mehr die Veränderungen der Landschaft als direkte Wirkungen, die **Kränkungen** verursachen.
- Die **Politik** muss den Benefit der Windkraft gegen die Belästigungen und Belastungen der Bevölkerung **abwägen.**

annoyance

Belästigung {f}

Verärgerung {f}

Beeinträchtigung {f}

Ärgernis {n}

Ärger {m}

Störung {f}

Verdruss {m}

Schikane {f}

Lästiges {n}

Verdruß {m} [alt]

Sekkatur {f} [österr.] [ugs.] [Belästigung]

Sekkiererei {f} [österr.] [ugs.] [Belästigung]

<http://www.dict.cc/englisch-deutsch/annoyance.html>

Annoyance ist der in der Fachliteratur am häufigsten verwendete Begriff, wenn die **Auswirkungen der Windkraft auf die Gesundheit** untersucht werden.

Annoyance macht krank!

Parameter	Distance (m) from residence to nearest IWT (mean)						P-Value ¹
	375-750 (601)	751-1400 (964)	375-1400 (792)	3300-5000 (4181)	5300-6600 (5800)	3000-6600 (5248)	
Mean PSQI ²	8.7	7.0	7.8	6.6	5.6	6.0	0.0461
% PSQI score > 5 ³	77.8	55.0	65.8	57.1	37.0	43.9	0.0745
Mean ESS ⁴	7.2	8.4	7.8	6.4	5.3	5.7	0.0322
% with ESS score > 10 ⁵	16.7	30.0	23.7	14.3	7.4	9.8	0.1313
Mean worsening sleep score post IWTs ⁶	3.2	3.1	3.1	1.2	1.4	1.3	< .0001
Improved sleep when away from IWTs	9 / 14	5 / 14	14 / 28	1 / 11	1 / 23	2 / 34	< .0001
% New sleep medications post IWTs	11.1	15.0	13.2	7.1	7.4	7.3	0.4711
New diagnoses of insomnia			2			0	
Mean SF36 MCS	40.7	43.1	42.0	50.7	54.1	52.9	0.0021
% Wishing to move away post IWTs	77.8	70.0	73.7	0.0	0.0	0.0	< .0001

¹ Testing difference of 375 – 1400 m group with 3000 – 6600 m group ² Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index ³ PSQI > 5 is considered a 'poor sleeper' ⁴ Epworth Sleepiness Scale ⁵ About 10 – 20 percent of the general population has ESS scores > 10 ⁶ (New sleep pro

Nissenbaum MA, Aramini JJ, Hanning CD: **Effects of industrial wind turbine noise on sleep and health.** *Noise & health* 2012, **14**(60):237-243

Untersuchung zum Einfluss der **Entfernung** zwischen Windrad und Wohnraum auf die Gesundheit:
2 Windparks in der USA:
Mars Hill (Nabenhöhe: 80m) und Vinalhaven, Maine

Ergebnis:

Innerhalb von **1400m** Entfernung:

- Schlechtere Schlafqualität
- Mehr Müdigkeit
- Mehr Schlafmittel
- Schlechtere Lebensqualität
- **> 70% wollen fort ziehen !!!**

Mars hill

Distance to nearest turbine (m) ¹	Predicted max. LAeq 1 hr ¹	Measured noise LAeq 1 hr ¹	
		Average	Range
244	51	52	50 – 57
320	48	50	48 – 53
366	47	49	47 – 52
640	42	44	40 – 47
762	41	43	41 – 46
1037	39	41	39 – 45
1799	35	37	32 – 43

Vinalhaven

Distance to nearest turbine (m) ²	Measured Noise LAeq ²	
	Trend Average	Range
152	53	51 – 61
366	46	38 – 49
595	41	39 – 49
869	38	32 – 41
1082	36	34 – 43

¹ Values read or derived from report figures; accuracy +/- 50 m and +/- 1 Db ² Values obtained with wind turbine noise dominating the acoustical environment, two-minute measurements during moderate-to-variable northwest winds aloft (less than full power)

Nissenbaum MA, Aramini JJ, Hanning CD: **Effects of industrial wind turbine noise on sleep and health.** *Noise & health* 2012, **14**(60):237-243.

gemessener Windpark Lärm

1200m = willkürlich und nicht begründet!!!

Eigene Erfahrung in Wilfersdorf II (Mistelbach)
105m Nabelhöhe:
Lärm mehr als 3km hörbar !!!
bei Windgeschwindigkeit 8km/h

Conclusion

Industrial wind turbines can harm human health if sited too close to residents. Harm can be avoided if IWTs are situated at an appropriate distance from humans. Owing

Jeffery RD, Krogh C, Horner B: **Adverse health effects of industrial wind turbines.** *Canadian family physician Medecin de famille canadien* 2013, **59**(5):473-475.

1200 m = zu nahe !!!!!

- **Windräder können die Gesundheit schädigen,** wenn sie **zu nahe** am Wohngebiet stehen.
- Schäden können vermieden werden, wenn die Anlagen in einer **entsprechenden Entfernung** von Menschen aufgestellt werden.

Gesundheitseffekte:

- **Hörbarkeit wird als unerträglich eingestuft**
 - > 3000m als Mindest- Abstand zu Wohngebiet
 - Sichere Distanz ist nicht sicher bestimmbar
- **Unzufriedenheit, Frust und Angst sind ungesund** und verursachen
 - Schlafstörungen, Müdigkeit, Depressionen
 - Verminderte Lebensqualität
- **Direkte Schädigungen durch Lärm ist unwahrscheinlich**
 - Keine Hörschäden, Tinnitus, Schwindel etc.
- **Infraschall ist noch nicht ausreichend erforscht!**

Das Projekt Windpark Trumau

hat in der geplanten Form durch den geringen Abstand zum Wohngebiet und die Größe und Anzahl der Windräder sicher **negative Auswirkungen auf die Gesundheit** und Lebensqualität der Einwohner.

Dr. Günther Frank,
Facharzt für Anästhesiologie und Intensivmedizin
Trumau, April 2014